Antitrust and the First-Sale Doctrine

Catherine J.K. Sandoval
Associate Professor
Santa Clara University School of Law
First-Sale Doctrine Conference, November 2010
The first-sale doctrine prohibited a patentee from using the patent laws to enforce restrictions on a patented good once the good had been sold.

First-sale doctrine restriction codified for copyright law

Roots in doctrine prohibiting restraints against alienation
Resale Price Maintenance

- Resale Price Maintenance (RPM) had been *per se* illegal for nearly 100 years under *Dr. Miles*

- In *Leegin* in 2007 the Supreme Court changed the standard for reviewing RPM arrangements to rule of reason

- RPM is not *per se* reasonable, must meet applicable standard
Conflicts between IP Rights and Antitrust Laws

- Do the restrictions imposed by the IP holder fall within the scope of IP rights?
- If the IP holder is trying to impose restrictions outside of the scope of its rights, this may raise antitrust law issues re:
  - Resale Price Maintenance
  - Monopolization of Aftermarkets
License vs. Sale

- Many transactions are being characterized as licenses to use IP rights not sales
- This raises many antitrust law questions re:
  - Applicability of the Robinson-Patman Act which prohibits price discrimination among competing dealers, but applies only to transactions in Goods
  - The boundaries between IP rights and antitrust law
  - Resale Price Maintenance
  - Monopolization of aftermarkets in product resale
E-books, License or Sale

- Amazon, for example, characterizes the sale of E-books as licenses to use copyright material and not sales

- User clicks “Buy Now”

- Questions about the characterization of transaction, incidents of sale
E-book Market and Resale Restrictions

- Amazon and Macmillan had a dispute about the price at which Amazon was selling Macmillan’s ebooks.
- Relationship recharacterized as Agency arrangement.
- Amazon notes price set by publisher.
- One factor in reasonableness of RPM is widespread nature of the practice, if practice is too widespread, less likely to be reasonable.
Start reading *Crystal Rain* on your Kindle in under a minute. Don’t have a Kindle? [Get your Kindle here.](#)

**Crystal Rain [Kindle Edition]**

Tobias S. Buckell (Author)

3.5 out of 5 stars (33 customer reviews)

Kindle Price: $7.99 & includes wireless delivery via Amazon Whispernet

Sold by: Macmillan

This price was set by the publisher

- Available on these devices
- Text-to-Speech: Enabled
- Don’t have a Kindle? [Get yours here.](#)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Formats</th>
<th>Amazon Price</th>
<th>New from</th>
<th>Used from</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Kindle Edition</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>$7.99</td>
<td>--</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Widespread Nature of Practice May be a Factor in Antitrust Liability

- Cf. Antitrust concern re: widespread practice indicator of unreasonableness (Leegin, Standard Fashions)

- IP industry arguments that licensing is the widespread practice and therefore the license characterization (as distinct from a sale) should be upheld
Antitrust Liability

- Restrictions on resale may be factors in Attempt to Monopolize or Monopoly Maintenance cases

- License label will not excuse tying arrangements
Beyond Labels

- The Court has long looked past the parties’ labels to determine the real character of the transaction.
- The Court emphasized the need for searching examination of the transaction in Dr. Miles.
- American Needle decided in 2010 emphasized the need to look beyond form.
Conclusion: Antitrust Analysis of First-Sale Doctrine Issues

- Expect more antitrust scrutiny of attempts to restrain resale
- Resale price maintenance
- Tying and other arrangements that limit competition